To Accreditation Council Of The Eurasian Center for Accreditation And Quality Assurance In Higher Education and Health Care

# REPORT

# OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7R09105 "HEMATOLOGY (ADULT)" OF NJSC "SEMEY MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR ACCREDITATION STANDARDS (PRIMARY) OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCE SPECIALTIES) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

period of external expert commission: 18.05.-20.05.2021

**SEMEY, 2021** 

# CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	EEC composition	4
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	8
2.1	Presentation of NJSC "SMU" and the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)"	8
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	8
2.3	Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)"	8
2.4	General assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational organizations	9
3.	Description of the stages of external expert commission and conclusion	10
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)» of NJSC "SMU" and an overview of the strengths for each standard	18
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)» of NJSC "SMU"	24
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	24
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards	25
	Attachment 2. Lists of residents, teachers and employers for interviews	26
	Attachment 3. List of documents studied by members of the EEC in the framework of specialized accreditation	29

# LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

AMP	LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:           Administrative and management personnel			
BD (O)	Basic disciplines (training)			
GP	General Practitioner			
University	Higher educational institution			
EKR	East Kazakhstan region			
SAC	State Attestation Commission			
SCES	State compulsory education standard			
GPA	Weighted average assessment of the level of educational achievements			
OIM	of a student in the chosen specialty			
DAD	Department of Academic Development			
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources			
DOPs	Direct observation			
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System			
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care			
FSA	Final state attestation			
IC	Individual curriculum (resident)			
ILS	information library system			
CVI	Coronavirus infection			
COC	Component of choice			
СЕР	Committee of educational programmes			
QED	Catalog of elective disciplines			
LMS	learning management system KEYPS			
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan			
Mini-CEX	Mini Clinical Exam			
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan			
MEO	Medical education organization			
MA	Methodical advice			
NJSC "SMU"	Non-profit Joint Stock Company "Semey Medical University"			
R&D	Research work of a resident			
IQAA	Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education			
SSC	Scientific student circle			
STP	Scientific and technical programme			
NCIE	National Center for Independent Examination			
EP	Educational programme			
IA	Intermediate attestation			
PBL	Problem- based learning			
MD	Major disciplines (training)			
РНС	Primary health care			
PPP	Faculty			
RSE on REM	Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management			
WC	Working curricula			
CBL	Case-based-learning			
NKR	North-Kazakhstan region			

QMS	Quality Management System			
SOP	Standard operating procedures			
IWS	Independent work of students			
IWR	Independent work of a resident			
SC	Simulation center			
IWRT	Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher			
TBL	Team-based-learning (training in a team)			
TC	Typical curricula			
ERWR	Educational and research work of residents			
AC	Academic Council			
CNM&O	Center for Nuclear Medicine and Oncology			
GCC	Graduate Career Center			

# 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 18 dated April 26, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct specialized accreditation of the Non-Commercial Joint Stock Company "Semey Medical University" in the period from May 18 to 20, 2021, in the following composition:







## Chairperson of the External Expert Commission

#### KUZGIBEKOVA ALMA BOLATOVNA,

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Childhood Diseases, Karaganda Medical University,

Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Accredited independent expert in assessing the quality of medical services.

## **Foreign expert**

### **RIPP EVGENY GERMANOVICH**

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Accreditation and Simulation Center of the Institute of Medical Education of the Federal State Budgetary Institution "National Medical Research Center named after V. A. Almazov " of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the Board of the Russian Society for Simulation Education in Medicine (ROSOMED), Member of the ROSOMED Programme Committee, Instructor of the European Resuscitation Council (ERC)

## National academic expert

ALMAGUL AMANGELDINOVNA KAUYSHEVA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-rector for educational and scientific activities of the Kazakhstan Medical University "HSPH", Accredited independent expert in assessing the quality of medical services, Deputy Chairperson of the Board RPO "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations".









# National academic expert SHUKIRBEKOVA ALMA BORANBEKOVNA, Doctor of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Professor, Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy NJSC "Astana Medical University"

### National academic expert (online)

ISENOVA SAULE SHAIKENOVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology NJSC " Asfendiyarov KazNMU"

## National academic expert

ESENKULOVA SAULE ASKEROVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Oncology NJSC " Asfendiyarov KazNMU " Member of the Association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan

#### National academic expert

KUDABAEVA KHATIMIA ILYASOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor Department of Internal Medicine №1 NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov "









National academic expert KENZHEGULOVA RAUSHAN BAZARGALIEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, neurology residency instructor of Corporate Fund "University Medical Center"

## National academic expert

RINAT MUZAFAROV, Head of the Department of International Cooperation and Public Relations of the Republican State Enterprise "Republican scientific and practical center of psychiatry, psychotherapy and narcology " of MoH RK

#### National academic expert

SADIEVA ZHANAR ZAMANKHANOVNA, anesthesiologist-resuscitator, Head of Postgraduate Education Department of JSC "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy"

# National academic expert

RAKHMANOV ELTAI UTEMURATOVICH, PhD

Deputy Director of Master's Degree in Sports Medicine and Rehabilitation of Nazarbayev University School of Medicine









# National academic expert RAMAZANOVA MANSHUK ANEROVNA, Senior Lecturer of the Department public health and Health care of NJSC " Asfendiyarov KazNMU"

#### **Expert - employers' representative**

SARSENBINA LYAZZAT KYRYKBAEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, highest qualification category in the specialty: "Public health", Chief physician of the MSOPE "CPMSP No. 12, Semey

#### **Expert - representative of undergraduates** MAZANBEKOVA MERUERT

YERZHANOVNA, 2nd year undergraduate student in the specialty "Pedagogy and Psychology" of the Kazakh Humanitarian - Legal Innovative University in Semey.

# **ECAQA Observer**

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department Of "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care"

tel .: +7 747 5609212, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" of NJSC "SMU" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards (primary) of postgraduate education programmes (specialties of residency) of medical education institutions of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

# 2.1 Presentation NJSC "Semey Medical University" and the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R110700 "Hematology"

Non-profit joint stock company "Semey Medical University "(NJSC "SMU") founded on September 1, 1953. The university was opened as the Semipalatinsk State Medical Institute. By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 192009 No. 199 PSE "Semipalatinsk State Medical Academy" was reorganized into RSE on REM "Semey Medical University" (Certificate of state re-registration of a legal entity No. 2064 -1917-27-ΓΠ dated 05/27/2009. Series No. 0311105). In 2019, State Medical University of Semey was reorganized into Semey Medical University. The university plans to implement new educational programmes of higher professional education, master's programmes, residency, doctoral studies, including in the specialty of residency7R09105 "Hematology (adult)"...

Educational programme in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)» of NJSC "SMU" has a state license and plans to be implemented from the 2021-2022 academic year... Responsible for training in residency is the Department of Hospital Therapy, NJSC "SMU". Clinical bases are 5 medical organizations: Emergency hospital in Semey, Hematology department (20 beds); Pavlodar regional hospital named after G. Sultanova, Hematology Department (20 beds); LLP "Hematology Center" Ust-Kamenogorsk (25 beds); Consultative and diagnostic center in Ust-Kamenogorsk, day hospital for 10 beds, a hematologist's office, and by 2022, Hematology center for 130 beds will open.

The main educational, scientific and clinical structural unit of NJSC "SMU", which coordinates the training in residency, is the dean's office of the School of Postgraduate Education (SPE).

### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational programme residency in the specialty 7R110700 and 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" is being held for the first time.

# 2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 ''Hematology (adult)''

Self-assessment report educational programme presented on 107 pages of main text, appendices on 16 pages (copies or electronic versions), located at the link<u>https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1fOqgwIQdZVLbEFX1y-</u>dh3CJoNhyw\_G9e?usp=sharing...

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 8 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of the information provided by the accredited EP. The report is accompanied by an accompanying a letter signed by the rector prof. E. T. Zhunusova, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of NJSC "SMU", who is responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes. Director of the Department of Academic Work Zhunusova A.B.

... Self-assessment of educational residency programmes carried out on the basis of the order on the basis of the order dated January 18, 2021 No. 32 "On the creation of the composition of the Working

group for writing the "Report on self-assessment of specialized and primary accreditation for 18 educational programmes of the NJSC "Semey Medical University".

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report did some work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with Accreditation standards for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational institutions (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 8 standards.

Database, applications for 16 pages, are presented in full, sequentially and there are references to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

## 2.4 General assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of programmes of postgraduate education (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guidelines, at the same time, based on the results of the expert commission, recommendations for adjustments were made, which were taken into account by the working group.

The report is written sequentially in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations, teaching documents, website pages <u>https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/</u>

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. All standards show actual practice of NJSC "SMU" for the preparation residents and all planned activities of the EP in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021-2022, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Self-assessment report description sufficiently is completed and updated according to the planned the number of residents, teachers, administration, information about the selection and admission, the results of training, the final results of the EP, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for the development of the EP in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)", etc.

Conclusion on each of the 8 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for implementation identified in the course of introspection and development prospects in this specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" of NJSC "SMU" contains an objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university conducted a self-assessment in the report at the expert commission stage.

## 3. Description of external expert commission

External expert work on the assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)"NJSC "SMU" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director general of the "Eurasian Center for

Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and the schedule approved by No. 18 of April 26, 2021 by the Director general of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector E.T. Zhunusov...

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with teaching staff and mentors, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural divisions, questioning teachers and residents of other specialties, a review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of educational and methodological documents both before the visit and during the visit, an automated information platform was studied (Capes with its tools for providing students with the necessary UM block, test tasks (validity and reliability are assessed by the Capes system), formative and integrated assessment, etc.), publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, programme of the internal quality assurance system.

On the part of the NJSC "SMU" staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites was ensured (Table 1).

Ν	FULL NAME.	Position		
0.				
1.	Zhunusov Ersin Tursynkhanovich	Chairperson of the Board - Rector		
2.	Zhanaspaev Marat Amangazievich	Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic		
		Affairs		
3.	Aidosov Nurzhan Sarsynbekovich	Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Strategic		
		Development and International Cooperation		
4.	Barsukov Andrey Sergeevich	Deputy Chairperson of the Board for		
		Organizational and Economic Work		
5.	Bulegenov Tolkyn Alpysbaevich	Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Scientific		
		and Clinical Work		
6.	Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbaevna	Director of the Department of Academic Work		
7.	Kozhakhmetova Dana Kenzhebaevna	Chief specialist of the department		
8.	Turarova Elmira Merkhatovna	Chief Specialist of the Graduate Employment		
		Department		
9.	Kyrykpaeva Ainur Serikovna	Chief specialist of the research department		
10.	Krykpaeva Saltanat Sayatovna	Director of the Department of Science		
11.	Enikeeva Dilyara Bulatbekovna	Director of the Department of Administrative and		
		Personnel Support		
12.	Kadirova Elmira Asylbekovna	Chief Specialist of the Human Resources and		
		Legal Department		
13.	Balashkevich Natalia Alexandrovna	And about. Head of the Department of Medical		
		Education		
14.	Mansurova Jamilya Anvarovna	Clinic Department Director		
15.	Ainur Tasbolatovna Karsakova	Chief Specialist of the Department of Strategic		
		Development and Quality Management System		
		(QMS)		
16.	Dzhakubekova Zhanar Sayatovna	specialist of the department of strategic		
		development and QMS		
17.	Nurtoleu Madina Khamitovna	specialist of the department of strategic		
		development and QMS		
18.	Sultakeeva Aizhan Beisenovna	specialist of the department of strategic		
		development and QMS		
19.	Kadirsizova Gulzhan Sayatovna	Library manager		

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, int	terviews
with members of the EEC	

Technician engineer       Operator	
(DSP and O)	
and Radiation	
t of the	
of the PST	
medical work	
ogy department	
Semey	
ogy department	
t of y of t mec ogy Sen	

63.	Maralbaev Aibol Rollanovich	EMCH Semey, Head of the Department of
		Endovascular Surgery
64.	Abishov Kuatzhan Muratovich	"East Kazakhstan Regional Hospital (EKRH)",
		deputy director for medical work, endovascular
		surgeon of the department of endovascular
		surgery and interventional cardiology
65.	Poltoranina Natalia Andreevna	Chief freelance cardiologist of the Health
		Department of the East Kazakhstan region, head.
		outpatient department of the diagnostic center
66.	Abisheva Mayra Nurkasovna	Head Department of Cardiology of Pavlodar
		Regional Cardiology Center
67.	Alibaeva Galiya Aytzhanovna	EMCH Semey, deputy director for medical work
68.	Bakaeva Lola Meyramkhanovna	EMCH Semey, head of the cardiology department
		No. 1, chief freelance cardiologist, Semey
69.	Nasymbekov Merhat Rymtaevich	EMCH Semey, head of the cardiology department
		No. 2
70.	Maralbaev Aibol Rollanovich	EMCH Semey, Head of the Department of
		Endovascular Surgery
71.	Abishov Kuatzhan Muratovich	"EKRH", deputy director for medical work,
		endovascular surgeon of the department of
		endovascular surgery and interventional
		cardiology
72.	Ablenova A.T.	Chairperson of the Committee of Educational
		Programmes (COP) of the bachelor's degree
		"Pharmacy", lecturer of the Department of
		Biochemistry and Chemical Disciplines named
		after Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor S.O.
L		Tapbergenova
73.	Bikbaev R.M.	chairperson of the CEP, coordinator of the 5th
		year, head teacher for academic work of the
		Department of Neurology, Otorhinolorhinology
<u> </u>		and Ophthalmology
74.	Yurkovskaya O.A.	chairperson of the COP internship, coordinator of
L		the 6 <sup>th</sup> year internship
75.	Tlemisov A.S.	Chairperson of the CEP of residency, responsible
		for the specialty of residency "Traumatology and
		Orthopedics, including children", Chief
		Coordinator, Head of the Department of
		Orthopedic Surgery

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the Attachment to this report.

### The first day of the visit is 05/18/2021.

An interview with the management and key employees of NJSC "SMU" made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8, namely, to identify approaches to developing the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of postgraduate education in clinical direction in the strategy of the university (plan), mechanisms in determining the appropriate specialty of residency of clinical sites and qualified teachers, guaranteeing the sufficiency of educational resources through planning public procurements and concluding agreements with country and international partners. The

experts studied in detail the documentation, working curricula, syllables, control and measuring instruments, intra-university regulatory documents.

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.).

The procedure for determining the goals and objectives of the residency educational programme, the content of training provides for discussion and approval at meetings of the collegial bodies of NJSC "SMU" - departments and COP, AK, which include representatives of practical health care, students, teachers and administrative staff.

Quality assurance of postgraduate training at NJSC "SMU" is carried out thanks to the process approach to the management of the educational programme (EP). The university has developed a map of the postgraduate training process, which contains indicators of the quality of the implementation of residency programmes, a description of the management life cycle. In addition, the university annually approves the Regulation of standard procedures, which includes the main activities for the process of postgraduate training, including the frequency of monitoring the EP.

Conversation with the Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Educationallowed the experts to find out that the implementation of the educational programme of residency is carried out on the basis of educational-methodological complexes of the specialty and the educational-methodical complex of discipline (EMCD), the latter includes: a modular educational programme; syllables; control and measuring equipment.

The NJSC SMU has a Mentoring School, including all clinical mentors of radiation therapists residents have been trained in this school, all have certificates. Clinical mentors are experienced EMC specialistsSemey and have the highest qualification category.

#### The second day of the visit is 05/19/2021.

This day was devoted to visiting clinical sites for the implementation of residency programmes. Clinical base of the specialty program7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" is an emergency hospital in the city of Semey, the structure of which includes a hematology department with 20 beds. At the clinical base, experts surveyed the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with the training courses in residency, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical health care.

The experts obtained evidence of the fulfillment of accreditation grades 2 and 6, as well as the validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

On the same day, interviews were held with teachers, residents of other specialties and employers (representatives of practical health care).

During an interview with the management of the clinical base, it was found that there is a high need for hematologists.

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, depending on the specific clinical base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work of residents) ... The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers.

In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, the resources in the department of hematology of the emergency room were interviewed with mentors.

The experts asked questions about the sufficiency of thematic patients at clinical sites, the sufficiency of time for practical training, patient access and work with medical records, as well as the

availability of certificates in pedagogy from mentors and the qualifications of teachers. In general, the mentors and teaching staff are confident in the sufficiency of educational resources and believe that NJSC "SMU" has extensive experience in teaching residents. Cooperation with the strategic partner Bashkent University (Ankara, Turkey) is also important.

Residency graduates of the specialty "Hematology (adult)" will be in demand and employed in various cities of the East Kazakhstan region.

Interviews with 13 employers on all the educational programmes of residency of NJSC "SMU" declared for accreditation were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of NJSC "SMU", satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of residency graduates, etc.

A review of resources showed that there are enough clinical bases for the implementation of the new residency programme:

- 1. Emergency hospital in Semey, Hematology department (20 beds)
- 2. Pavlodar Regional Hospital named after G. Sultanov Hematology Department (20 beds)
- 3. LLP "Hematology Center" Ust-Kamenogorsk (25 beds)
- 4. Consultative and diagnostic center in Ust-Kamenogorsk, day hospital for 10 beds, hematologist's office
- 5. In 2022, the Hematological Center in Ust Kamenogorsk with 130 beds will open.

#### The third day of the visit May 20, 2021

The experts studied the documentation of the responsible department of hospital therapy, which confirmed compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for 2019-2020 academic year and report for 2019, individual teacher plans (PPP), EMCD, questionnaires with representatives of practical health care, reviews of the programme in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)", the code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), i.e. confirms the educational, methodological and resource readiness of the university to receive residents and implement an educational programme in hematology.

Then a meeting of the EEC members took place following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC started to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of the EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. Experts have individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme for Compliance with the Standards of residency programme accreditation in medical education institutions of ECAQA". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department planning to implement an educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairperson of the EEC prof. Kuzgibekova A.B. a final open vote on recommendations for NJSC "SMU" and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council were held. Then the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment as part of the accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

#### **Results of the survey.**

An observer from ECAQA in November 16-18, 2020 conducted an online survey of residents and teachers of NJSC "SMU" on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com/</u>...

**Residents survey results:** 

The total number of responding residents - 200...

Of the total number of respondents, residents of 1 year of study prevailed - 34%, 2 years of study - 22.5%, 3 years of study - 22.5%, 9.5% bachelors, 7.5% undergraduates.

Will recommend this university as an educational organization - 86% completely agree, 11% partially, 2% completely disagree with this statement, 1% doubt to answer.

90% of the respondents fully agree and 8.5% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their problems in learning, completely disagree with this statement 1 and 0.5% of students hesitate to answer.

Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committee of educational programmes) in 86.5%, 3% are not involved, they know nothing about it 5.5, 2% of respondents doubt to answer, sometimes 3 %.

Most of the students are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, the audience of this educational organization - 88.5%, partially satisfied 10%, completely dissatisfied 0.5%, partially dissatisfied 0.5%, doubt to answer 0.5% of respondents

Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes in 92% of cases, partially in 6%, 1% completely disagree with this statement, 0.5% partially disagree, 0.5% of students doubt the answer. 91.5 respondents are completely satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators, scientific advisers, partially 6%, not completely satisfied 1.5%, partially dissatisfied 0.5%, do not know their mentor, curator 0.5% of students. According to 81% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes. Respectfully

According to 93% of students believe that the educational organization has access to participation in research work, partially 6%, completely disagree 0.5% and partially agree 0.5%. 90.5% of students are completely satisfied with the library fund, 9% are partially satisfied, 0.5% are partially satisfied. 97% of students noted sufficient access to electronic educational resources, 3% are partially satisfied.

According to the respondents, 90.5% are completely satisfied with the availability of medical services, 7% are partially satisfied and 2% are not completely satisfied.

94.5% believe that social programmes to support students exist and are being implemented in the educational organization, 0.5% do not agree with this opinion, 4% have not heard about such programmes and 1% do not know what they are asking about.

93.5% fully agree that the educational organization has established a system of self-study for students, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students, 5.5% partially agree, 0.5% partially disagree, 0.5% doubt the answer.

The organization of clinical training for residents, according to 84.5%, fully satisfies them, and 12.5% partially. Fully (74%) and partially (22%) satisfied with the teaching methods. There is enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.) - 93.5% fully agree, 5.5% partially. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills - 94.5% fully agree, 3.5% partially. In the opinion of 88.5% of teachers in the classroom, they use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, and in the opinion of 0.5% - rarely.

In the opinion of 92% of the respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes, but in the opinion of 5% - sometimes and 0.5% - rarely. The availability of educational guidance for students was noted by 99%.

According to a survey, 74.5 students are engaged in research work. And 7.5% plan to start research work, 3% are looking for research and development work. During training, 55.5% of students have published works during training, while 23.5% have more than one publication

According to 87% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism to improve educational programmes, but 8.5% believe that it is not necessary to carry out and 4% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive - 97.5%, satisfactory - 0.5%.

#### **Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes:**

The total number of teachers on the list is 67.

The total number of respondents was 67, including those with work experience of up to 5 years - 20.9%, up to 10 years - 14.9%, over 10 years - 64%. Fully 82% are satisfied with the organization of

the educational process, partially - 16.4%. Residency teachers 38.81%. 89.55% of the respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace, partially 8.96% and 1.49% of the respondents completely disagree. The organization has an opportunity for career growth and development of competence for teachers - 83.58% fully agree, 14.93% partially, and 1.49% partially disagree.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research - 77.61% fully agree, 14.93% partially, 1.49% completely disagree, 2.99% partially disagree, no answer 2.99% ... 68.66% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 28.36% are partially satisfied, 2.99% doubt the answer. The majority of 91.04% of the respondents had undergone advanced training over the past 5 years. 91.04% of the respondents have the opportunity to realize themselves as professionals, and 8.96% - in part. When asked whether the university supports the teacher in participation in international and national events with payment of travel, travel expenses, registration fee of 52.24%, 7.46% do not pay fees, 16.42% do not address this question to the management, no response rate of 17.91%, 59.7% are aware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 31.34% do not know about this, 7.46% doubt the answer. Management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 62%, sometimes - 25.32% of respondents. When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work in small groups (62.69%), analysis of situational tasks (88%), oral questioning and analysis of a topic (71% and 64%, respectively), also problem-oriented training (38.8%), solving tests (71%), less often cases are compiled and solved (71%). 64% fully agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and residency educational programmes; 28.3% partially agree with this. Management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 62%, sometimes - 25.32% of respondents. When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work in small groups (62.69%), analysis of situational tasks (88%), oral questioning and analysis of a topic (71% and 64%, respectively), also problemoriented training (38.8%), solving tests (71%), less often cases are compiled and solved (71%). 64% fully agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and residency educational programmes; 28.3% partially agree with this. Management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 62%, sometimes - 25.32% of respondents. When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work in small groups (62.69%), analysis of situational tasks (88%), oral questioning and analysis of a topic (71% and 64%, respectively), also problem-oriented training (38.8%), solving tests (71%), less often cases are compiled and solved (71%). 64% fully agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and residency educational programmes; 28.3% partially agree with this. respectively), also problem-oriented learning (38.8%), test solving (71%), less often cases are compiled and solved (71%). 64% fully agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and residency educational programmes; 28.3% partially agree with this. respectively), also problem-oriented learning (38.8%), solving tests (71%), less often cases are compiled and solved (71%). 64% fully agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and residency educational programmes; 28.3% partially agree with this.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the Attachment and, in general, demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of training on residency programmes, at the same time, identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, the availability of leadership and administration for teachers and residents, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers) ...

#### Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme for NJSC "SMU" was analyzed. All the

information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the reliability of the information provided by NJSC "SMU" and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, NJSC SMU described its best practice in adherence to accreditation standards, during the external expert commission, the EEC members studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2023, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control measuring instruments, checklists, portfolios of residents, individual plans of residents for the 2020-2021 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, an internal quality assurance system programme, resources for training were viewed directly on the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency were taken into account (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KP DSM-16), paragraph 13. It was established that the clinical bases of all residency programmes are 40 levels of medical care (from primary health care to highly specialized). There are \_4\_\_ clinical sites on the accredited educational programme, of which experts\_1\_ visited. In connection with the new edition of order No. 647 On the approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.No. KR DSM-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), there have been changes and additions in the educational programme in relation to the development of the research competence of residents, which must participate in the work of the research team.

There is no general provision or requirements for the implementation of scientific work at the university, at the same time, the departments conduct proactive research, in which residents participate through writing reviews, collecting patient data, analyzing the literature and patient examination results, preparing reports and presentations at conferences). Also, in accordance with Article 222 of the Residency of Clause 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan On People's Health and the Health care System No. 360-VI ZRK dated July 7, 2020, external experts studied the activities and conducted conversations with mentors and it was established that each resident will be provided with a mentor.

The accredited educational programme and the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base are assessed according to the current state educational standard (SCES) and for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and mentors, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (committee of educational programmes / CEP, meetings of departments), evaluation of the educational programme (CEP), decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in appeal commissions for receiving and evaluating residents, developing the content of individual resident plans and choosing mentors.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the university leadership on 20.05.2021.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. On the part of the NJSC "SMU" team participation of all persons specified in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of employees responsible for postgraduate education of NJSC "SMU", department, employees of clinical bases, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational residency programme by specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)» of NJSC "SMU" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

The staff of the department, implementing the residency programme, as the basis of the mission of the educational programme and goals, accepted the mission of the university and informed the interested parties (teachers, employers, residents) about it in order to clearly understand the tasks and strive to meet the needs of practical Health care. The structure of the educational programme, where there is a dominance of practical training (75%), the sufficiency of clinical bases and a mentoring system allow strengthening the patient-centered approach in the care and treatment of patients. The university organized training and clinical practice in compliance with safety for all participants in the educational process (safety precautions, use of PPE, instructions before training).

Responsible for the residency programme 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" is the Department of Hospital Therapy, where a variety of innovations are applied in the educational process, which allow developing the basic and special competencies of future residents, namely, work at the patient's bedside, clinical analyzes, solving situational problems, protecting medical records, training in laboratories.

The experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of an educational programme in terms of the elective component, the current and final assessment policy, including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral questioning, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents (specialty exam), personnel policy in relation to teachers under the accredited educational programme, as well as the distribution of resources (classroom fund of clinical bases according to contracts).

The EMCD defines the final learning outcomes in accordance with the qualification requirements for the residency specialty.

OP 7R09105 "Hematology" is posted on the website of NJSC "SMU" in the tab "Residency" https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/rezidentura /

At the same time, the participation of practical health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme is not sufficiently reflected.

Overall, Standard 1 demonstrates compliance.

#### Strengths:

1) Effective strategic planning and management, with the strengthening of the role of the educational process in the preparation of competitive personnel in the relevant health sector;

2) Implementation of postgraduate education programmes based on international quality standards in education.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 17 standards conform: completely -17, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Involve residents in the work of advisory bodies (councils, working groups) to formulate a mission and proposals for a strategic development plan.

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

Within the framework of a strategic partnership with Bashkent University (Ankara, Turkey) from 2019-2020, the university underwent significant changes in terms of the development of educational programmes, in particular, during the development of EP in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)", when forming, they were based on the educational programme of Bashkent University complying with international standards. Thus, the accredited residency programme in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" is compiled in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.<u>No. KR DSM-12/2020</u>Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes) and adapted to the programme of Bashkent University (Ankara, Turkey). The educational programme of residency 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)", approved in the Register of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and posted on the website of the university:<u>https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnyeprogrammy/rezidentura/</u>

The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined. The mechanism for the development and approval of the residency programme is determined and regulated by the CEP. EP was reviewed by a physician hematologist of the highest category, head of the therapeutic department of PST No. 7, Semey Telmembetova A.D. with positive assessment.

The staff of the departments has the necessary competencies for training, at the same time, the mentors represented by the staff of the clinical base, despite their professional level, do not fully master pedagogical techniques, which limits the implementation of a high-quality transfer of professional knowledge and skills. The teachers of the departments use a variety of methods of active (CBL, TBL, SP, CBD (discussion of a clinical case), CS (situation analysis), mini-clinical exam (MCE), DOBS (assessment of practical skills) training, in which staff members undergo periodic training In the course of a survey of mentors, the answer was affirmatively received that they pass the School of the Mentor, where they get acquainted with pedagogical skills.

In total, according to the primary accredited educational programme, 10 mentors are planned in clinics who carry out their activities in accordance with the Regulation on mentors. No precedents of inequality, lack of ethics or other violations of a gender, cultural or religious nature have been established in the process of external evaluation.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied.

Thus, the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R110700 "Hematology" demonstrates the integration between education and medical care, adapted with the programme of the strategic partner Bashkent University (Ankara, Turkey).

#### **Strong point:**

 Long-term memorandum of strategic partnership with Bashkent University (Ankara, Turkey). *Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 31 standards correspond: fully - 31, significantly
- 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

## Standard 2: completed

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) In order to improve the quality of the educational programme, conduct a systematic analysis of feedback from employers, followed by corrective measures.

2) Attract foreign partners as external reviewers of educational programmes, teaching materials, scientific publications.

#### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

IN NJSC "SMU" a policy for assessing residents has been developed and implemented, including the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the "Academic policy of the university" (order No. 195 of 08/28/2019), the Regulation on the current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of NJSC "SMU" students... Responsibility for the implementation

of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of residents is borne by the teaching staff of the departments, heads of departments (modules), the office of the registrar.

The assessment of the educational achievements of residents covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by departments / modules - control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options for correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is posted on the website <u>https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/akademicheskij-rejting-obuchajushhegosja/</u>...

As an additional method for assessing residents, the portfolio is used, which the experts got acquainted with at the departments supervising the residency programmes. Residents are engaged in research work, which must necessarily end with the publication of a scientific article or a report at scientific and practical conferences. The assessment of scientific work also affects the overall assessment of the discipline.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2020. in the specialties of residency. The results of the achievement of students are exhibited in the electronic journals of the system "Sirius until 2019", "Platonus 2020", "Keyps-2021".

The possibility of an appeal based on the results of the interim and final certification of residents is determined in the "Academic Policy" (<u>https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/politika-disciplin/</u>).

Planning procedure, organization, monitoring and analysis of assessment methods in KazNMU ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring instruments is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in assessing knowledge in residency, then it is introduced at the department.

Thus, this standard is generally implemented at the university.

### **Strong point:**

1) Use in the educational process of the automated information platform "KEYPS" in order to ensure the quality of the educational process and other digital technologies.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 11 standards conform: completely - 11, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Monitor the implementation of innovative educational technologies by teachers in the educational process and formalize this process (acts of implementation).

#### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

The policy of admission and selection to residency in the NJSC "SMU" is focused on the priorities of the health care needs of the East Kazakhstan region, Pavlodar regions and the Republic of Kazakhstan as a whole. The first appointment is scheduled for 2021-2022. and will be carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 and the Regulations on the admission of students to NJSC "SMU" https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/postuplenie/pravila-priema...

The number of admitted residents will be regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum permissible load on the curators, the provision of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of clinical bases, as well as material and technical resources of the NJSC SMU and the need of the region for doctors of the specialty "Hematology".

#### **Strong point:**

1) The presence in the structure of the university of a system of health care for students, a psychological service, a department for employment of graduates and the medical foundation of NJSC "SMU".

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 30 standards conform: fully - 29, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

### Standard 4: completed

# Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Inclusion of residents in advisory working groups when developing policies for admission and selection of residents.

## Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY

In accordance with the mission of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Hematology", the university has approved the competencies of the teaching staff, which are necessary for the successful implementation of the learning process of residents. In order to ensure the periodic assessment of teachers and staff, a KPI system has been introduced.

At the Department of Hospital Therapy, the total number of teachers is 6 people: 1 - Doctor PhD; 4 - candidate of medical sciences. The share of teaching staff with academic degrees and titles is 62.5%. The average age of the department staff is 48.6 years. All teachers timely undergo advanced training in their specialty, as evidenced by the high level of the teaching staff category: four teachers have the highest category, two have the first.

In order to continuously improve the quality of teaching specialized disciplines in NJSC "SMU", teaching staff is trained on an ongoing basis in modern pedagogical technologies used in the world educational environment for postgraduate training of medical personnel.

In the 2020-2021 academic year, 3 teachers at the department underwent advanced training in pedagogical competence: "Effective teaching in a medical university", "Development of educational programmes." Since 2018, clinical mentors have been studying at Mentoring Schools, where they master teaching and assessment methods, the principles of evidence-based medicine. Thus, the new educational programme is provided with an appropriately qualified staff of teachers with experience in conducting training at the postgraduate level. There is a resource of mentors - employees of clinics, whom the university plans to involve in training residents.

# Strengths:

1) Effective interaction of the staff of the department with employers, mentors on the preparation of highly qualified graduates.

2) Improving the competence of teaching staff and mentors on teaching methodology, assessing the knowledge of students, on an ongoing regular basis.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 7 standards conform: completely - 7, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

## Standard 5: completed

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To increase the publication activity of the department staff in foreign publications, especially in journals included in international citation bases.

### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

For the implementation of EP in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)" there are the following clinical bases: Emergency hospital in Semey, Hematology department (20 beds); Pavlodar regional hospital named after G. Sultanov Hematology department (20 beds); LLP "Hematology Center" Ust-Kamenogorsk (25 beds); Consultative and diagnostic center in Ust-Kamenogorsk, day hospital for 10 beds, hematologist's office and in 2022 the Hematological center in Ust-Kamenogorsk with 130 beds will open. Thus, compliance with the accreditation standard for the provision of material resources and the sufficiency of the bed capacity (105) for the implementation of the new residency programme was found.

To obtain evidence, the experts visited the hematology department of the Emergency Hospital. Other clinics are not visited due to restrictions on the epidemic situation with covid. It was found that the hospital has a study room with computers and Internet access.

Residents have the opportunity for deep and wide participation in self-development and improvement of scientific research due to the fact that the university has opportunities for constant access to all leading medical portals (Cochrane, Webofscience, BMJ bestpractice, CambridgeJournals, Uptodate, etc.). Journalclub is actively functioning at the departments, where residents make weekly news reports.

#### Strengths:

1) A sufficient number of clinical sites for rotations in the study of disciplines of the educational programme.

2) Copyright information programmes developed by the university: Orion, Talent pool "Nadezhda", "Catalog of scientific projects", "Register of debtors", etc.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 21, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** 

1) Update the material and technical base, including a map of methodological security and purchase modern educational literature in the disciplines of the specialty programme "Hematology (adult)"

#### **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

The experts obtained evidence that the university has a system for assessing and monitoring the quality of educational programmes through the functioning of a group of independent experts who assess the quality of conducting classes. This mechanism coordinates the Committee for Educational Programmes (CEP) and specialized educational departments.

The School of Postgraduate Education (SPE) has developed questionnaires for clinical mentors to assess the clinical rotation of residents, which will provide objective information about the quality of training organization, the effectiveness of the schedule. Results of the questionnaire information on the results of the questionnaire is reported to the Academic Council. The collection of information on the clinical practice of residency graduates is carried out by SPE in accordance with the Regulations on residency of NJSC "SMU" dated 02/01/2021, as a structural unit that controls the process of training residents. Upon completion of the residency and employment of residents from employers, feedback on satisfaction with specialists is collected. Informing about the work of the specialized department, collegial bodies on the changes in the programme will be carried out through the placement of all information on the website of NJSC "SMU" in the public domain. Every year, the heads of medical organizations in which our graduates will be employed will provide feedback on the competence of doctors. Based on these reviews, decisions will be made to improve the quality of the Hematology residency study programme.

The monitoring of the quality of the educational process and the satisfaction of consumers of educational services is carried out by experts of the COP, the Academic Committee (AC). The use of the automated information platform "KEYPS" in the educational process provides monitoring of the quality of the educational process.

#### **Strong point:**

1) The presence of a stable and effective system for evaluating residency educational programmes and the presence of a responsible body - COP, AC.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 13, significantly - 2, partially -0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Active participation of stakeholders, including foreign partners, in the development and discussion of educational residency programmes in the specialty "Hematology (adult)".

#### Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

The university has a strategic partner - Bashkent University (Turkey).

The residency programme is provided with appropriate management and guidance. The main role in the organization of the educational process, the formation and implementation of the residency programme and the provision of the programme with educational and methodological documentation is performed by the Department of Academic Work (DAR), which also coordinates the activities of the School of Young Teachers and the School of Manager. This process also involves the School of Postgraduate Education, the Department of Strategic Planning, and, first of all, the specialized department.

For the purpose of methodological support and monitoring of the quality of the educational process, the Committee of Educational Programmes, the Academic Committee and the Academic Council have been created and are functioning.

The distribution of financial resources, human resources is carried out on the basis of the strategic plan, its goals and objectives.

The key issues of the distribution of the financial resources of the university (the university budget) are resolved in three stages: at the first stage at a meeting of the Economic Council, at the second - by the University Council, at the third NS (in the near future - by the Board of Directors). Information on the results of the financial and economic activities of the university and the execution of the cost estimate is heard annually at the Academic Council of the university, which is broadcast online on the university's Facebook page.

Admission to the resilenture in the specialty "Hematology (adult)" is planned for the 2021-2022 academic year and will be held in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600 dated October 31, 2018 and the internal regulation of NJSC "SMU" on admission to residency. The number of places in residency will be determined in accordance with the needs of specialists in the regions under the supervision of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The selection of applicants is carried out through the entrance examination, which is held by NJSC "SMU" in accordance with the educational programme in the specialty "Hematology (adult)"...

Information about the conditions of admission and the educational programme in the specialty "Hematology (adult)" will be posted in the section https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/postuplenie/rezidentura/...

Thus, the university has built a system for managing the educational process at the postgraduate level of education, aimed at ensuring the quality of residency programmes and interaction with the practical Health care sector. Responsibility for the final result of training residents is a key point in management. Strategic partnership with a Turkish university contributes to strengthening the position of the Semey Medical University in the Kazakh and international educational space.

#### Strengths:

1) The development of NJSC "SMU" is based on the principles of improving the management system and quality, taking into account a flexible response to market requirements

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 15, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

#### Standard 8: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Further development of international cooperation for the effective implementation of the residency programme in the specialty "Hematology (adult)".

Thus, all 8 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria for each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and carrying out the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert commission programme were found.

# 5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R09105 "Hematology (adult)» of NJSC "SMU":

- 1. Ensure the participation of residents in the work of advisory bodies (councils, working groups) on the formulation of a mission and proposals for a strategic development plan (standard 1).
- 2. Conduct a systematic analysis of feedback from employers, followed by corrective actions (standard 2).
- 3. Attract foreign partners as external reviewers of the educational programme, teaching materials, scientific publications (standard 2).
- 4. Ensure the participation of residents in advisory working groups in the development of policies for the admission and selection of residents (standard 3).
- 5. Monitor the implementation of innovative educational technologies by teachers in the educational process with the subsequent formalization of this process (acts of implementation) (standard 5).
  - 6. Promote publication activity of teachers in foreign publications, including journals included in international citation bases (standard 5).
  - 7. Update the material and technical base, including a map of methodological security and purchase modern educational literature in the disciplines of the programme "Hematology (adult)" (standard 6).
  - 8. Ensure the active participation of stakeholders, including foreign partners, in the development and discussion of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Hematology (adult)" (standard 7).
  - 9. Develop international cooperation for the effective implementation of the residency programme in the specialty "Hematology (adult)" (standard 8).

# 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the Accreditation Council to accredit educational programme 7R09105 "Hematology (Adult)" of NJSC "Semey Medical University" for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson		KUZGIBEKOVA ALMA
Chan per son		BOLATOVNA
		BOLATOVNA
Foreign expert		RIPP EVGENY
	ALST	GERMANOVICH
Academic expert	J. Ky 26	ALMAGUL
-	AN AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND A	AMANGELDINOVNA
		KAUYSHEVA
	Ttall	
Academic expert	на Ана	SHUKIRBEKOVA ALMA
	Ru ,	BORANBEKOVNA,
Academic expert		ISENOVA SAULE
	Plances	SHAIKENOVNA,
	- accurat	~~~~,
Academic expert	×	ESENKULOVA SAULE
	Juny	ASKEROVNA,
Academic expert	(T	KUDABAEVA KHATIMIA
	M	ILYASOVNA
Academic expert	The	KENZHEGULOVA
		RAUSHAN
A	, not	BAZARGALIEVNA
Academic expert	V	RINAT MUZAFAROV,
Academic expert	New	SADIEVA ZHANAR
	· ·	ZAMANKHANOVNA
	park and >	
Academic expert		RAKHMANOV ELTAI
	Num I	UTEMURATOVICH, PhD
Academic expert	Omeny	RAMAZANOVA
	Q	MANSHUK ANEROVNA
Expert - employers'	- ug	SARSENBINA LYAZZAT
representative	dler	KYRYKBAEVNA
Representative of		MAZANBEKOVA
undergraduates	North	MALANDEROVA MERUERT
		YERZHANOVNA
ECAQA Observer		UMAROVA MAKPAL
		ALDIBEKOVNA

			G	rade	
Standard	Criteria for evaluation	ncides	lly lls	ompliant	natch
Sta	Number of standards = BS * / SU	Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES 17 = 10/7	10/7			
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 31 = 22/9	22/9			
3.	ASSESSMENT OD STUDENTS 11 = 7/4	7/4			
4.	<b>STUDENTS 30 = 18/12</b>	18/11	1		
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY 7 = 5/2	4/2	1		
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES 21 = 10/11	10/11			
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION 15 = 10/5	10/5			
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION 15 = 8/7	8/7			
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL 4 = 1/3	-			
	Total: 147 = 90/57	89/56	1/1	-	-
			1	147	

# Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) Of educational programme in the specialty of residency 7R110700 ''Hematology» of NJSC ''SMU''

\* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfillment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

# Attachment 2

# List of interview with participants

N o.	Full name	Academi c degree	Category availability	Exper ience	Promotion in pedagogy	Place of work
1.	Nurgalieva Dariga Toleugazinovna	Ph.D.	Graduate Hematologist	25 years	"Effective teaching in a medical university" of NJSC SMU 01.03- 18.03.2021 in the amount of 54 hours "Preparation of a self- assessment report for a higher educational institution within the framework of specialized accreditation" 13.02.2020 (Semey ) in the amount of 54 hours	"NJSC SMU" Semey
2.	Zhumagalieva Ardak Nazilovna	Doctor PhD	Specialist hematologist certificate, therapist of the highest category	27 years	"Development of communication skills in teaching clinical disciplines" KSMU Karaganda 02.10.2017-14.10.2017 in the amount of 54h	"NJSC SMU" Semey
3.	Makenova Ardana Ablaevna	-	The highest category of hematologist	35 years	-	Ust-Kamenogorsk branch "NJSC SMU" concurrently
4.	Seisenbekova Zhannur Baltabaevna	-	Highest category of hematologist	36 years	-	Pavlodar branch "NJSC SMU" concurrently

# List of clinical mentors

Ν	Full name	Category	Exper	Place of work	Promotion in
0.		availability	ience		pedagogy
1.	Beshimbaeva Zhuldyz	Graduate	13	Head of the hematology	June 2021
	Islakhatovna	Hematologist	years	department of the emergency	
		_	old	hospital in Semey	
2.	Telmembetova Asima	Graduate	36	Head of the therapeutic	In June 2021
	Dankebaevna	Hematologist	years	department PST No. 7, Semey	

# Attachment 3

# List of documents requested by EEC members within the framework of accreditation

No.	Title of the document	Quantity	Date of approval
1.	<b>1.</b> Questionnaire forms "Assessment 360 <sup>0</sup> " in the		EMC Minutes No. 6
	context of specialties (as an example, there is no		dated November 22,
	recruitment of residents for the specialty		2016
	"Hematology")		
2.	Duty schedule	4	Monthly

3.	Job descriptions of the Foundation's health workers	3	Different periods for each provider
4.	Resident job description	1	10.10.2016 EMC protocol No. 5
5.	Job descriptions of employees	1	03.03.2020 year
5. 6.	Catalog of elective disciplines	1	Minutes 10 dated
0.	Catalog of elective disciplines	1	09/02/2020
7.	Mission of NJSC "SMU" and development	1	2019 year
7.	strategy	1	2019 year
8.	Residency educational programme in	1	2020 year
0.	"Hematology" (educational and methodological	1	2020 year
	complex of the discipline, list of electives)		
9.	Agreements and memorandums: agreements with	3	2016 to 2020
9.	clinical bases, agreements with residents,	5	2010 to 2020
	Memorandums of cooperation		
10	Research work of residents (as an example, there	1	05/30/2017 Minutes No.
10.	—	1	5
	is no recruitment of residents in the specialty		3
11	"hematology")	1	12/30/2015 Minutes of
11.	Code of Conduct	1	
			the Management Board
10			No. 3
12.		1	2016-17 years
13.	Regulations for Clinical Academic Departments	1	06/19/2020, No. 12
14.	Regulation on the Department of Science and Education	1	29.10.2018, No. 26
15	Regulations of other departments	1	
16.		2	
10.		1	02/15/2018
	process of residency of NJSC "SMU"	1	
18.	Rules for the search, selection, recruitment and certification of workers in NJSC "SMU"	1	11/19/2015
19.	Rules for the search, recruitment, selection and	1	November 19, 2015 as
	certification of employees of NJSC "SMU"		amended in 2016, 2018
20.		1	2018, as amended from
	5		2019
21.	Orders	7	From 2016-2020
22.	Working curricula for the accredited EP	4	2016, 2017, 2018, 2020
23.	Working curricula	4	From 2017-2020
24.	Schedule in residency	4	2016-2020 years
25.	Syllables	3	2016-17, 2018, 2020
26.	Resident lecture attendance log	1	1.09-12.09.2020
20.	Resident duty schedule	2	09.2020, 12.2020
27.		-	Protocols from 2016 to
20.			2020
29.	e	2	For 2019, 2020
	council		
30.	Staffing table	3	NRCMCH -
			11/30/2020, RDC -
			11/30/2020, AMP -
			December 2020

31.	Operational plan for the implementation of the strategy	1	03/27/2020
32.	Regulation on teaching staff	1	Minutes 9 dated 28.08.2019
33.	Charter of NJSC "SMU" (as amended)	1	05/12/2020
	Instruction checklist of internal training	2	
	SCES	1	2015 and 2020
36.	Mission of NJSC "SMU"	1	2019 year
37.	Documents of the Educational and Methodological Council	4	06.11.2020
38.	Guidebook for applicants and students in residency	1	2020 year
39.	List of residents	3	
40.	Residency budget for 2020	1	2020 year
	Quality management programme	1	
42.	Employer Application Form	1	2020 year
	Scientific works of residents (as an example, there is no recruitment of residents in the specialty "hematology")	2	2019, 2020
44.	Continuing Education Certificates in Teaching Skills	3	2015, 2017, 2017
45.	Certificates for the successful completion of the course-seminar "Methodology for the development of examination material" to assess the key competencies of students "	2	November 24, 2020 NCIE
46.	Certificates / Testimonials PC "Methodology for developing the image of results-oriented programmes" 54 hours	2	11/18/2019 NJSC "SMU"
47.	Examination materials for the accredited EP	1	2017-2018
	Interim certification results	1	2017-2018
49.	Sheets and tests (as an example, there is no recruitment of residents for the specialty "hematology")	3	2017-2018
50.	Library attendance log	1	2019-2020
51.	Regulations on residency of NJSC "Semey Medical University"	1	02/01/2021
52.	Independent examination regulation	1	04/22/2019
53.	Regulations on mini-libraries of departments of NJSC "Semey Medical University"	1	21.10.2019
54.	Regulations on the student assessment committee of NJSC "Semey Medical University"	1	11/15/2019
55.	Regulations on the clinical mentor of the resident of NJSC "Semey Medical University"	1	05/22/2020
56.	Academic policy of NJSC "Semey Medical University" for the 2019-2020 academic year	1	09/02/2019
57.	Regulations on enrollment in elective disciplines	1	05/29/2020
58.		1	Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 30, 2008 No. 28

59.	The rules for referral for study abroad, including within the framework of academic mobility, were approved by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 19, 2008 No. 613, with amendments dated December 30, 2011 No.	1	Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 19, 2008, as amended on December
	549.		30, 2011
60.	Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 "On Education".	1	07/27/2007
61.	Discipline policy	1	04.07.2019
62.	PPP certificates	15	